# DOCKET FILE COPY ORIGINAL



**Donald I. Marshall**Regulatory Affairs
Assistant Vice President

201 E. Fourth St., 102-910 P. O. Box 2301 Cincinnati, Ohio 45201-2301 Phone: (513) 397-1289 Fax: (513) 397-2408 dmarshall@cinbell.com

June 26, 1997

Mr. William F. Caton, Acting Secretary Federal Communications Commission 1919 M Street NW Room 222 Washington DC 20554 RECEIVED

JUN 26 1997

FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY

In the Matter of:	)	
	)	
Access Charge Reform	)	CC Docket No. 96-262
	)	
	)	

Dear Mr. Caton:

Enclosed are an original, 16 copies plus two extra public copies, and a diskette copy of the Comments of Cincinnati Bell Telephone Company's Further Notice of Proposed Rulemaking in the above referenced proceeding. A duplicate original copy of this letter and attached Comments is also provided. Please date stamp this as acknowledgment of its receipt and return it. Questions regarding these Comments may be directed to Patricia Rupich at the above address or by telephone on (513) 397-6671.

Sincerely,

Donald I. Marshall

Enclosure

cc: Competitive Pricing Division (two copies)

Ho, of Capics moid 04-18

# DOCKET FILE COPY ORIGINAL

# Before the FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION Washington, D.C. 20554

RECEIVED

JUN 26 1997

FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY

In the Matter of	)	
	)	
Access Charge Reform	)	CC Docket No. 96-262

## COMMENTS OF CINCINNATI BELL TELEPHONE COMPANY

#### I. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

Cincinnati Bell Telephone Company ("CBT"), an independent, mid-sized local exchange carrier, submits these comments in response to the Commission's Further Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (FNPRM) released May 16, 1997, seeking comment on the imposition of a presubscribed interexchange carrier charge (PICC) on special access lines and the allocation of general support facilities (GSF) costs for price cap LECs. CBT opposes the imposition of a PICC on special access lines as well as any change in the allocation of GSF costs.

#### II. DISCUSSION

CBT asserts that the Commission should not impose a PICC on special access lines to recover common line revenues. The Commission recognizes that such a requirement would be inconsistent with its established practice that special access not subsidize other services. At the very time when the Commission is moving to a cost-causative system of access charges by removing subsidies from access rates, the idea of adding a new subsidy to a highly competitive service is counterproductive and economically inefficient. With this proposal, the Commission is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> FNPRM at ¶ 404.

attempting to correct pricing inefficiencies created by the current subsidies by creating a new subsidy and associated pricing inefficiencies. CBT submits that it is better to live with the possible shift from switched access to special access that the Commission believes may occur as a result of the PICC than to try to correct it by imposing a new subsidy on a competitive service.

As shown in the comments of CBT and others filed in this proceeding, the market for special access is highly competitive.<sup>2</sup> Incumbent LECs have lost or will lose market share in every major city and CBT is no exception. With the availability of unbundled elements and increased use of collocation under the requirements of the Act, competition for special access will continue to expand. CBT urges the Commission not to distort the efficiencies of a competitive market by imposing unnecessary subsidies on special access services.

CBT also asserts the Commission should not, at this time, change the allocation of GSF costs. The Commission proposes two options to change the allocation of price cap LECs' interstate GSF costs to respond to AT&T's claim that the current allocation results in an implicit cross-subsidy of nonregulated billing and collection services. This is not a new issue. The Commission has not seen fit to change the allocation in the past and CBT submits that the Commission has shown no evidence that circumstances have changed sufficiently to warrant a change at the present time. CBT asserts that instead of continuing the piecemeal approach to correcting misallocations, the Commission should request that a joint board be convened to address separations reform. Once separations reform has concluded, the Commission should proceed with correcting Part 69 misallocations.

However, if the Commission decides to move forward with changes in the allocation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Comments of CBT filed January 29, 1997 at pp. 3-4.

process without going through the joint board, the Commission should reject the two options proposed in the FNPRM. The first option would require a detailed study every six months to ascertain the use of computer investment in Account 2124. Conducting such a study could be particularly burdensome for smaller price cap LECs like CBT. CBT questions whether the insignificant reduction in access rates that this proposal would generate, warrants the additional burden that these studies would require.

Although the second option is administratively simpler, it would result in the allocation of some support facilities to billing and collection which are not associated with billing and collection, such as Special Purpose Vehicles and Garage Equipment. It makes no sense to correct one misallocation only to create another.

If a change is to be made, CBT supports the alternative proposed in USTA's comments in this FNPRM which simplifies the process by using currently available accounting data and avoids changes to other access elements.

## III. <u>CONCLUSION</u>

CBT urges the Commission not to apply PICCs to special access lines, nor to change the allocation of GSF costs.

Respectfully submitted,

Christopher J. Wilson Christine M. Strick FROST & JACOBS LLP 2500 PNC Center 201 East Fifth Street Cincinnati, Ohio 45202 (513) 651-6800

Thomas E. Taylor Sr. Vice President-General Counsel Cincinnati Bell Telephone Company 201 East Fourth Street, 6th Floor Cincinnati, Ohio 45202 (513) 397-1504

Attorneys for Cincinnati Bell Telephone Company

Filed: June 26, 1997

427240.02

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that copies of the foregoing Cincinnati Bell Comments of Further Nortice of Proposed Rulemaking have been sent via first class United States Mail, postage prepaid, or by hand delivery, on June 26, 1997, to the persons listed on the attached service list.

Judy Piermeier

William F. Caton, Acting Secretary\* **Federal Communications Commission** 1919 M Street Room 222 Washington DC 20554

Common Carrier Bureau 1919 M Street Room 518 Washington DC 20554

International Transcription Services \* 1919 M Street Street Room 246 Washington DC 20037

Joseph DiBella **NYNEX Telephone Companies** 1320 North Court House Road 8th Floor Arlington VA 22201

Competitive Pricing Division (two copies)

Robert Sbaratta **BellSouth Corporation** BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. 1155 Peachtree Street NE, Suite 1700 Atlanta GA 30309-3610

Richard Tettelbaum Citizens Utilities Company 1400 16th Street NW Suite 500 Washington DC 20036

Michael Shortley Frontier Corporation 180 South Clinton Avenue Rochester, NY 14646

Ward Wueste **GTE Service Corporation** 1850 M Street NW Suite 1200 Washington DC 20036

Marlin Ard Pacific Telesis Group 140 New Montgomery Street San Francisco, CA 94105

Mary Marks Southwestern Bell Telephone Company One Bell Center Room 3520 St Louis MO 63101

Anne MacClintock Southern New England Telephone Company 227 Church Street New Haven CT 06510

**Gregory Cannon** US West Communications Inc. 1020 19th Street NW Suite 700 Washington DC 20036

Steven Sanders Northern Arkansas Telephone Company Inc 301 East Main Street Flippin AR 72634

Stephen Lamb TCA Inc **Telecommunications Consultants** 3617 Betty Drive Suite I Colorado Springs CO 80917

Mary McDermott United States Telephone Association 1401 H Street NW Suite 600 Washington DC 20005

David Cosson Rural Telephone Coalition NTCA 2626 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Washington DC 20037

Joanne Salvatore Bochis National Exchange Carrier Association Inc. 100 South Jefferson Road Whippany NJ 07981

Diane Smith
Independent Telephone
& Telecommunications Alliance
AllTel Corporate Services Inc
655 15th Street NW Suite 220
Washington DC 20005-5701

Clint Frederick Frederick & Warinner 10901 West 84th Terrace Suite 101 Lenexa KS 66214-1631

Carolyn Hill
ALLTEL Telephone Services Corporation
655 15th Street NW Suite 220
Washington DC 20005

Michell Brecher Fleischman and Walsh LCI International Telecom Corp 1400 Sixteenth Street NW Washington DC 20036 Margot Smiley Humphrey Rural Telephone Coalition NRTA 1150 Connecticut Avenue NW Suite 1000 Washington DC 20036

Lisa Zaina
Rural Telephone Coalition
OPASTCO
21 Dupont Circle NW Suite 700
Washington DC 20036

Richard Johnson Moss & Barnett Minnesota Independent Coalition 4800 Norwest Center Minneapolis MN 55402-4129

Kenneth Burchett GVNW 7125 SW Hampton Portland OR 97223

Jeffrey Beck
Beck & Ackerman
Small Western LECs
Four Embarcadero Center Suite 760
San Francisco CA 94111

Leon Kestenbaum Sprint Corporation 1850 M Street NW 11th Floor Washington DC 20036

Charles Helein America's Carriers Telecommunication Association 8180 Greensboro Drive Suite 700 McLean VA 22102 Mark Rosenblum AT&T 295 North Maple Avenue Room 3245G1 Basking Ridge NJ 07920

Bradley Stillman MCI Communications Corporation 1801 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Washington DC 20006

Dana Frix Swidler & Berlin ACC Long Distance Corp 3000 K Street NW Suite 300 Washington DC 20007

David Irwin
Irwin Campbell & Tannenwald
ITC Inc
1730 Rhode Island Avenue NW Suite 200
Washington DC 20036-3101

Edward Shakin
Bell Atlantic Telephone Companies
1320 North Court House Road 8th Floor
Arlington VA 22201

Michael Fox John Staurulakis Inc 6315 Seabrook Road Seabrook MD 20706

George Petrutsas Fletcher Heald & Hildreth Roseville Telephone Company 1300 North 17th Street 11th Floor Rosslyn VA 22209 Danny Adams
Kelley Drye & Warren
Cable & Wireless Inc
1200 19th Street NW Suite 500
Washington DC 20036

Gary Mann IXC Long Distance Inc 98 San Jacinto Suite 700 Austin TX 78701

Benjamin Dickens Blooston Mordkofsky Jackson & Dickens Western Alliance 2120 L Street NW Suite 300 Washington DC 20037

Kent Larsen Cathey Hutton and Associates 2711 LBJ Freeway Suite 560 Dallas TX 75234

Margot Smiley Humphrey Koteen & Naftalin TDS Telecommunications Corporation 1150 Connecticut Avenue NW Suite 1000 Washington DC 20036

John List Rural Telephone Finance Cooperative 2201 Cooperative Way Herndon VA 20171

Joe Edge Drinker Biddle & Reath Puerto Rico Telephone Company 901 15th Street NW Suite 900 Washington DC 20005 Scott Smith Alaska Telephone Association 4341 B Street Suite 304 Anchorage AK 99503

Thomas Crowe Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands 2300 M Street NW Suite 800 Washington DC 20037

James Bradford Ramsay
National Association of
Regulatory Utility Commissioners
1201 Constitution Avenue Suite 1102
Post Office Box 664
Washington DC 20044

Mary Newmeyer Federal Affairs Adviser Alabama Public Service Commission PO Box 991 Montgomery AL 36101

Stanley Gorinson Preston Gates Ellis & Rouvelas Meeds Microsoft Corporation 1735 New York Avenue NW Washington DC 20006

Randolph May Sutherland Asbill & Brennan Compuserve Incorporated Prodigy Services Corporation 1275 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Washington DC 20004-2404

Mark O'Connor
Piper & Marbury
Commercial Internet Exchange Association
1200 Nineteenth Street NW Suite 700
Washington DC 20036

James Burg South Dakota Public Utilities Commission State Capitol Pierre SD 57501-5070

Maureen Helmer New York State Department of Public Service Three Empire State Plaza Albany NY 12223-1350

Peter Arth Helen Mickiewicz California State and Public Utilities Commission of the State of California 505 Van Ness Avenue San Francisco CA 94102

Jack Krumholtz Microsoft Corporation 5335 Wisconsin Avenue NW Suite 500 Washington DC 20015

Edwin Lavergne Ginsburg Feldman and Bress Interactive Services Association 1250 Connecticut Avenue NW Washington DC 20036

James Love Consumer Project on Technology PO Box 19367 Washington DC 20036

Donna Lampert Mintz Levin Cohn Ferris Glovsky America Online Inc 701 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Suite 900 Washington DC 20004 Laurie Pappas
Office of Public Utility Counsel
1701 N Congress Avenue 9-180
Austin TX 78711-2397

David Bergmann Ohio Consumers' Counsel 77 South High Street 15th Floor Columbus OH 43266-0550

Colleen Boothby
Levine Blaszak Block & Boothby
Ad Hoc Telecommunications Users Committee
1300 Connecticut Avenue NW Suite 500
Washington DC 20036

Dr Barbara O'Connor Alliance for Public Technology 901 15th Street NW Washington DC 20005

David Newburger
American Association for
Adult and Continuing Education al, et
One Metropolitan Square Suite 2400
St Louis MO 63102

Susan Hafeli Keller & Heckman American Petroleum Institute 1001 G Street NW Suite 500 West Washington DC 20001

Henry Levine Levine, Blaszak, Block & Boothby Bankers Clearing House / MasterCard International Incorporated and Visa USA Inc 1300 Connecticut Avenue NW Suite 500 Washington DC 20036

Ronald Binz Competition Policy Institute 1156 15th Street NW Suite 310 Washington DC 20005

Michael Ettner General Services Administration 18th & F Streets NW Room 4002 Washington DC 20405 Brian Moir Moir & Hardman International Communications Association 2000 L Street NW Suite 512 Washington DC 20036-4907

Kathleen Abernathy AirTouch Communications Inc. 1818 N Street NW Washington DC 20036 Christopher Savage Centennial Cellular Corp 1919 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Suite 200 Washington DC 20006

Curtis White Allied Associated Partners Allied Communications Group 4201 Connecticut Avenue NW Suite 402 Washington DC 20008-1158

Albert Kramer
Dickstein Shapiro Morin & Oshinsky
ICG Telecom Group Inc
2101 L Street NW
Washington DC 20037-1526

Stephen Kraskin Kraskin & Lesse Illuminet 2120 L Street NW Suite 520 Washington DC 20037

Robert Hoggarth
Personal Communications Industry Association
500 Montgomery Street Suite 700
Alexandria VA 22314-1561

Dana Frix Swidler & Berlin Telco Communications Group Inc 3000 K Street NW Suite 300 Washington DC 20007

Charles Hunter
Hunter & Mow
Telecommunications Resellers Association
1620 I Street NW Suite 701
Washington DC 20006

Thomas Jones
Willkie Farr & Gallagher
Time Warner Communications Holdings Inc.
1155 21st Street NW
Washingtn DC 20036

Reginald Bernard SDN Users Association Inc PO Box 4014 Bridgewater NJ 08807

Norman Myers Ozarks Technical Community College PO Box 5958 Springfield MO 65801 Daniel Brenner National Cable Television Association Inc. 1724 Massachusetts Avenue NW Washington DC 20036

Glenn Manshin Blumenfeld & Cohen SpectraNet International Inc 1615 M Street NW Suite 700 Washington DC 20036

Randall Lowe Piper & Marbury Tele-Communications Inc 1200 19th Street NW Washington DC 20036

Teresa Marrero
Teleport Communications Group Inc
Two Teleport Drive
Staten Island NY 10311

Mark Sievers Swidler & Berlin WinStar Communications Inc 3000 K Street NW Suite 300 Washington DC 20007

John Benedict Piper & Marbury DSC Communications Corporation 1200 19th Street NW Washington DC 20036

Fred Seigneur Services-Oriented Open Network Technologies Inc (SONETECH) 109 Kale Avenue Sterling VA 20164 Steven Nourse Public Utilities Commission of Ohio 180 East Broad Street Columbus OH 43215-3793

Lawrence Crocker
Public Service Commission
of the District of Columbia
717 14th Street NW
Washington DC 20005

Joseph Paykel Media Access Project 1707 L Street NW Suite 400 Washington DC 20036

Carol Henderson American Library Association 1301 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Suite 403 Washington DC 20004

Jon Radoff 1630 Worcester Road #421 Framington MA 01701

Lesla Lehtonen California Cable Television Association 4341 Piedmont Avenue Cakland CA 94611

Kathy Shobert General Communications Inc 901 15th Street NW Suite 900 Washington DC 20005 Pat Wood Public Utility Commission of Texas 1701 N Congress Avenue Austin TX 78711-3326

Scott Rubin Pennsylvania Internet Service Providers 3 Lost Creek Drive Selinsgrove PA 17870

Ronald Dunn Information Industry Association 1625 Massachusetts Avenue NW, Suite 700 Washington DC 20036

David Brown Newspaper Association of America 529 14th Street NW Suite 440 Washington DC 20045

Michae Skrivan Harris Skrivan & Associates 8801 South Yale Suite 220 Tulsa OK 74137

Christopher Klein Tennessee Regulatory Authority Staff Utility Rate division 460 James Robertson Parkway Nashville TN 37243-0505

Penny Baker Missouri Public Service Commission PO Box 360 Jefferson City MO 65102 Myra Karegianes Illinois Commerce Commission 160 N LaSalle Street Suite C-800 Chicago IL 60601

Robert Aamoth
Reed Smith Shaw & McClay
Competitive Telecommunications Association
1301 K Street NW Suite 1100 East Tower
Washington DC 20005

James Brennan NYSERNet Inc Rensselaer Technology Park Troy NY 12180-7698

Cynthia Miller Florida Public Service Commission 2540 Shumard Oak Boulevard Tallahassee FL 32399-0850

Jonathan Jacob Nadler Squire, Sanders & Dempsey Internet Access Coalition 1201 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Box 47 Washington DC 20044

Wayne Leighton Citizens for a Sound Economy Foundation 1250 H Street NW Suite 700 Washington DC 20005

Richard Finnigan, Vandeberg, Johnson & Gandara Washington Independent Tel. Association 1201 Pacific Avenue
P.O. Box 1315
Tacoma WA 98401

Richard Hemstad Washington Utilities and Transportation Commission 1300 S Evergreen Park Drive SW Olympia WA 98504-7250

John Rother American Association of Retired Persons 601 E Street NW Washington DC 20049

Roger Hamilton Public Utility Commission of Oregon 550 Capitol St NE Salem OR 97310-1380

Lyman Welch 190 S LaSalle St Suite 3100 Chicago IL 60603

Edward Addison Virginia State Corporation Commission 1300 East Main Street 9th Floor PO Box 1197 Richmond VA 23218

Thomas Crowe Law Offices of Thomas Crowe Excel Telecommunications Inc 2300 M Street NW Suite 800 Washington DC 20037

David Heinemann Kansas Corporation Commission 1500 SW Arrowhead Road Topeka KS 66604 Martha Hogerty (MO. Bar #30052) Joint Consumer Advocates Office of the Public Counsel PO Box 7800 Jefferson City MO 65102

Carl Meyer 2701 Second Avenue #302 San Diego CA 92103

Minnesota Internet Service Trade Association (MISTA) 2829 University Avenue SE Suite 200 Minneapolis MN 55414

Consumers' Utility Counsel Division Governor's Office of Consumer Affairs 2 ML King Jr Drive Plaza Level East Suite 356 Atlanta GA 30334-4600

Communications Workers of America 501 Third Street NW Washington DC 20001 Peter Rohrbach Hogan & Hartson WorldCom, Inc. 555 13th Street NW Washington DC 20004-1109

Jeanne Walsh Kurtis & Associates Lincoln telephone Telegraph Company 2000 M Street NW Suite 600 Washington DC 20036 Michael Pabian Ameritech 2000 West Ameritech Center Drive Room 4H82 Hoffman Estates, IL 60196-1025

Joseph Paykel Internet Users Coalition Media Access Project 1707 L Street NW Suite 400 Washington DC 20036 David Bender John Crosby Special Libraries Association 1700 18th Street NW Washington DC 20009-2514

Glenn Manishin
Blumenfeld & Cohen-Technology Law Group
Internet Consumer Parties (NETACTION)
1615 M Street NW Suite 700
Washington DC 20036

Glen Manishin
Michael Specht
Blumenfeld & Cohen-Technology Group
Juno Online Services
1615 M Street NW Suite 700
Washington DC 20036

Mary Brooner Motorola Inc 1350 I Street NW Suite 400 Washington DC 20005 William Reier Reddy Begley & McCormick Montana Broadcasters Association 1001 22nd Street NW Suite 350 Washington DC 20037 Edgewood Senior High School Student Council 2428 Blake Road Ashtabula Ohio 44004

University of California, Berkeley School of Information Management & Systems 102 South Hall #4600 Berkeley CA 94720-4600

Robert Jones Nathaniel Hardy Hardy & Ellison 9306 Old Keene Mill Road Suite 100 Burke VA 22015

Paul Kuzia Arch Communications Group Inc 1800 West Park Drive Suite 350 Westborough MA 01581

Stan Wise Georgia Public Service Commission 244 Washington St SW Atlanta GA 30334-5701

Joel Shifman Maine Public Utilities commission 242 State Street Augusta MA 04333-0018

James Maret
Office of Consumer Advocate
Lucas State Office Bldg 4th Floor
Des Moines IA 50319

Ramsey Woodworth Wilkes Artis Hedrick & Lane United States Internet Providers Association 1666 K Street NW #1100 Washington DC 20006

Peter Rohrbach Hogan & Hartson GE American Communications Inc (American) 555 Thirteenth Street NW Washington DC 20004

Werner Hartenberger
Laura Phillips
Dow Lohnes & Albertson
Cox Communications Inc
1200 New Hampshire Avenue NW Suite 800
Washington DC 20036

Robert Halperin Crowell & Moring State of Alaska 1001 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Washington DC 20004

Herbert Marks Squire Sanders & Dempsey State of Hawaii 1201 Pennsylvania Avenue NW PO Box 407 Washington DC 20044

Peter Arth Lionel Wilson People of State of California and the Public Utilities Commission of State of California 505 Van Ness Avenue San Francisco CA 94102

Noel Parks 2184 Hunters Ridge Blvd Beavercreek OH 45434 Benjamin Dickens Gerard Duffy Blooston Mordkofsky Jackson & Dickson 2120 L Street NW Suite 300 Washington DC 20037

Glenn Manishin Michael Specht Blumenfeld & Cohen-Technology Law Group 1615 M Street NW Suite 700 Washington DC 20036

Jeffrey Sheldon Sean Stokes UTC 1140 Connecticut Avenue NW Suite 1140 Washington DC 20036

Richard Metzger Association for Local Telecommunications 1200 19th Street NW Suite 560 Washington DC 20036

Kocurek and Associates 11 Greenway Plaza Suite 2930 Houston TX 77046

David McClure Association of Online Professionals 6096 Franconia road Suite D Alexandria VA 22310 Riley Murphy Charles Kallenbach American Communications Services Inc 131 National Business Parkway Suite 100 Annapolis Junction MD 20701

Sheila Jackson Lee 18th District Texas 410 Cannon House Office Building Washington DC 20515

John Lamb Northern Telecom 2100 Lakeside Boulevard Richardson TX 75081

Ramgopal Kurpad 11103 Captains Walk Court North Potomac MD 20878-4223

Linda Leigier Topp 13806 Farmstead Way Chester VA 23831